



Service of Process Transmittal

11/28/2017

CT Log Number 532375634

TO: Kathleen Sturgeon

Markel Midwest, Inc. 10 Parkway North Deerfield, IL 60015-

RE: **Process Served in Delaware**

FOR: Essex Insurance Company (Domestic State: DE)

According to our records representation services for this entity have been discontinued in this jurisdiction.

ENCLOSED ARE COPIES OF LEGAL PROCESS RECEIVED BY THE STATUTORY AGENT OF THE ABOVE COMPANY AS FOLLOWS:

TITLE OF ACTION: OSCAR CONSTRUCTION SERVICES, LLC, Pltf. vs. Essex Insurance Company, Dft.

DOCUMENT(S) SERVED: Summons, Complaint, Notice, Statement

COURT/AGENCY: Essex County Superior Court - Law Division, NJ Case # ESXL00831217

NATURE OF ACTION: Insurance Litigation

ON WHOM PROCESS WAS SERVED: The Corporation Trust Company, Wilmington, DE

DATE AND HOUR OF SERVICE: By Process Server on 11/28/2017 at 14:30

JURISDICTION SERVED: Delaware

APPEARANCE OR ANSWER DUE: Within 35 days from the date you received this summons, not counting the date you

received it

ATTORNEY(S) / SENDER(S): Charles R. Mathis

125 Half Mile Road, Suite 201 Red Bank, NJ 07701

732-704-4647

SOP Papers with Transmittal, via UPS Next Day Air, 1Z0399EX0105413733 **ACTION !TEMS:**

Email Notification, Richard Grinnan rgrinnan@markelcorp.com

Email Notification, Kathleen Sturgeon LegalRegulatory@markelcorp.com Email Notification, Donna Strauss Donavant ddonavant@markelcorp.com

Email Notification, Laurie Ford ford@markelcorp.com

SIGNED: The Corporation Trust Company ADDRESS:

1209 N Orange St

Wilmington, DE 19801-1120

TELEPHONE: 302-658-7581

RECEVED

DEC 0 1 2017

LAWDEPT

Page 1 of 1 / HK

Information displayed on this transmittal is for CT Corporation's record keeping purposes only and is provided to the recipient for quick reference. This information does not constitute a legal opinion as to the nature of action, the amount of damages, the answer date, or any information contained in the documents themselves. Recipient is responsible for interpreting said documents and for taking appropriate action. Signatures on certified mail receipts confirm receipt of package only, not contents.

SUMMO	NS		
Attorney(s) Charles R. Mathis, IV Office Address 125 Half Mile Road, Suite 201	Superior Court of		
Town, State, Zip Code Red Bank, NJ 07701	Now Jarson		
	ESSEX	COUNTY	
Telephone Number (732) 704-4647	LAW	DIVISION	
Attorney(s) for Plaintiff Charles R. Mathis, IV	Docket No: ESX-L-008	3312-17	
OSCAR CONSTRUCTION SERVICES, LLC			
Plaintiff(s)	CIVIL AC	TION	
Vs.	SUMMONS		
ESSEX INSURANCE COMPANY	SUMME		
Defendant(s)			
From The State of New Jersey To The Defendant(s) Named Above	::		
answer or motion and proof of service with the deputy clerk of the from the date you received this summons, not counting the date you clerk of the Superior Court is available in the Civil Division Managhttp://www.judiciary.state.nj.us/prose/10153_deptyclerklawref.pdf file your written answer or motion and proof of service with the Cle Box 971, Trenton, NJ 08625-0971. A filing fee payable to the Tre Information Statement (available from the deputy clerk of the Supe it is filed. You must also send a copy of your answer or motion to jor to plaintiff, if no attorney is named above. A telephone call will answer or motion (with fee of \$135.00 and completed Case Informations).	u received it. (A directory of the gement Office in the county listed f.) If the complaint is one in forecerk of the Superior Court, Hughes easurer, State of New Jersey and a crior Court) must accompany your plaintiffs attorney whose name arout protect your rights; you must ation Statement) if you want the county of the co	addresses of each deputy above and online at closure, then you must s Justice Complex, P.O. completed Case answer or motion when ad address appear above, file and serve a written court to hear your	
If you do not file and serve a written answer or motion within 3 the relief plaintiff demands, plus interest and costs of suit. If judgm money, wages or property to pay all or part of the judgment.			
If you cannot afford an attorney, you may call the Legal Service Services of New Jersey Statewide Hotline at 1-888-LSNJ-LAW (1-not eligible for free legal assistance, you may obtain a referral to an A directory with contact information for local Legal Services Office Division Management Office in the county listed above and online http://www.judiciary.state.nj.us/prose/10153 deptyclerklawref.pdf.	888-576-5529). If you do not han attorney by calling one of the La es and Lawyer Referral Services i at	ve an attorney and are awyer Referral Scrvices. is available in the Civil	
DATED: 11/28/2017			
Name of Defendant to Be Served:			
Address of Defendant to Be Served: 1209 Orange Street			

Wilmington, DE 19801

Revised 09/04/2012, CN 10792-English (Appendix XII-A)

Date Served: 11/28/17
Time Served:

Charles R. Mathis IV, Esq.
NJ Bar I.D. No.: 060872013
Robert T. Trautmann, Esq.
NJ Bar I.D. No.: 037562005
MERLIN LAW GROUP, P.A.
125 Half Mile Road, Suite 201
Red Bank, New Jersey 07701
732-704-4647 / 732-704-4651 (Fax)

Attorneys for Plaintiff

OSCAR CONSTRUCTION SERVICES, LLC,

Plaintiff

vs.

ESSEX INSURANCE COMPANY,

Defendant.

SUPERIOR COURT OF NEW JERSEY LAW DIVISION – ESSEX COUNTY

CIVIL ACTION

DOCKET No.: ESX-L

COMPLAINT AND JURY DEMAND

COMES NOW the Plaintiff, OSCAR CONSTRUCTION SERVICES, LLC ("Plaintiff"),

by and through its undersigned counsel, by way of Complaint against the above named Defendant, ESSEX INSURANCE COMPANY states as follows:

NATURE OF THE CASE

- This is an action by the Plaintiff, policyholder, against its insurance carrier, ESSEX
 INSURANCE COMPANY ("Essex" or "Defendant"), for benefits owed under the
 insurance policy, which have not been paid, as a result of property insurance claim for
 damage related to vandalism.
- 2. Plaintiff purchased a commercial insurance policy from Essex, which covers direct physical loss as a result of vandalism.
- 3. Essex failed to pay the damages due and owing under the insurance policy, and further acted in violation of the implied duty of good faith and fair dealing contained in the insurance policy, further damaging the Plaintiff.

MERLIN LAW GROUP, PA 125 Half Mule Road Sude 201, Red Bank New Jersey, 07701 www McTimbaegroup, com

PARTIES

- 4. Plaintiff was and is a business incorporated in the State of New Jersey and the owner of the property at issue located at 47 Chelsea Avenue, Newark, New Jersey 07106 (the "Property").
- Defendant, Essex is an insurance company authorized to do business in the State of New Jersey.

JURISDICTION AND VENUE

- 6. Defendant Essex is subject to the jurisdiction of this Court because it issued an insurance policy, which was to be performed in the State of New Jersey, and the Defendant failed to pay benefits to the Plaintiffs.
- 7. Subject-matter jurisdiction is proper in the Law Division pursuant to New Jersey Rules of Civil Procedure Rule 4:3-1(a)(4).
- 8. Venue is properly laid in Essex County pursuant to New Jersey Rules of Civil Procedure Rule 4:3-2(b), because the subject property is located within Essex County and the Defendant voluntarily insured property located in Essex County.

FACTS COMMON TO ALL COUNTS

- Plaintiff, at all relevant times, has been the owner of certain real property located at 47
 Chelsea Avenue, Newark, New Jersey 07106.
- 10. The aforementioned property is a multi-family residential property.
- 11. Plaintiffs purchased commercial insurance policy, Policy Number P037559 (the "Policy") from Essex which covered the property at issue in this matter.

MERLIN LAW GROUP, PA 125 Half Mile Road Suite 201, Red Bank New Jersey, 07701 www.Merjinlaw.group.com

- 12. All premiums on the Policy were paid, and the Policy was in full force and effect at all relevant times herein.
- 13. The Policy includes insurance coverage for, *inter alia*, the risk of direct physical loss to the premises rented by the policyholder, including vandalism.
- On or about December 29, 2015, Plaintiff's property suffered damage as a result of vandalism.
- 15. Vandalism and the resulting damage is a covered risk under the Policy.
- 16. The Plaintiff's property sustained significant losses as a result of damage relating to the vandalism.
- 17. Plaintiffs promptly submitted an insurance claim to Essex for the damage to the property caused by damage relating to the vandalism damage.
- 18. Essex assigned claim number 2CS5358 to the Plaintiff's claim.
- 19. Essex sent an adjuster to evaluate the damage to the Plaintiff's property associated with the vandalism.
- 20. Defendant, through their adjuster only provided coverage from a small portion of the damages to the Plaintiff's property.
- 21. The Plaintiffs sought professional help to determine the amounts owed under the Policy, because they disagreed with Essex's denial.
- 22. Plaintiff has cooperated with Essex and have complied with all post-loss obligations listed in the Policy.
- 23. Essex has failed and refused to promptly or properly adjust the Plaintiff's losses from damage relating to the vandalism loss.

MERLIN LAW GROUP, PA 125 Half Mile Road Sude 201, Red Bank New Jersey, 07701 www.Merlinlawgroup.com

- 24. The Plaintiff suffered damages from the vandalism loss for which Essex has failed to pay.
- 25. Plaintiff has demanded payment pursuant to the terms of the Policy.
- 26. Essex has failed and refused to pay the insurance proceeds to Plaintiff as required under the Policy.
- 27. Essex's failure and/or refusal to pay the insurance proceeds due and owing under the Policy constitutes a breach of the express terms of the insurance contract.
- 28. Plaintiff has done and performed all those matters and things properly and reasonably required and requested of it under the Policy.
- 29. As a direct result of Essex's breach of the insurance contract, Plaintiff has suffered and continues to suffer financial damages.
- 30. As a direct result of Essex's breach of the insurance contract, Plaintiff was required to become obligated for attorney's fees and costs in connection with the prosecution of this action.

COUNT ONE - Breach of Contract

- 31. Plaintiff incorporates by reference the allegations set forth in Paragraphs 1 through 30 as if set forth in full herein.
- 32. Plaintiff and Essex entered into an insurance contract whereby Essex promised to pay for covered damages to Plaintiff's property.
- 33. Plaintiff's property sustained covered losses caused by a vandalism loss on or about December 29, 2015.
- 34. Plaintiff has demanded payment pursuant to the terms of the Policy.

MERLIN LAW GROUP, PA 125 Half Mile Road Sude 201, Red Bank New Jerzey, 07701 www Merlinbyeroup.com

- 35. Essex has failed and refused to pay the insurance proceeds to Plaintiff as required under the Policy.
- 36. Essex's failure to pay the insurance proceeds is a breach of the express terms of the contract.
- 37. As a result of Essex's breach of the insurance contract, Plaintiff has suffered and continues to suffer damages.

WHEREFORE, Plaintiff, OSCAR CONSTRUCTION SERVICES, LLC demands judgment against ESSEX INSURANCE COMPANY on Count One for:

- (a) Compensatory damages;
- (b) Consequential damages;
- (c) Pre-judgment interest and post-judgment interest;
- (d) Costs of suit;
- (e) Attorneys' fees; and
- (f) For such other relief as the court may deem equitable and just.

COUNT TWO -- Breach of Implied Covenant of Good Faith and Fair Dealing

- 38. Plaintiff incorporates by reference the allegations set forth in Paragraphs 1 through 37 as if set forth in full herein.
- 39. Plaintiff and Essex entered into an insurance contract whereby Essex promised to pay for covered damages to Plaintiff's property.
- 40. That contract includes an implied covenant of good faith and fair dealing. This covenant includes, but is not limited to duties to honestly, promptly, and fairly investigate facts of

MERLIN LAW GROUP, PA 125 Haff Mile Road Sude 201, Red Bank New Jersey, 07701 WKW Mediniawarous.com coverage, evaluate damages, adjust the loss, communicate and cooperate with the insured, and promptly pay the full amount of covered losses.

- 41. Essex failed to properly adjust Plaintiff's claim by engaging in activities that include, but are not limited to:
 - a. Failing to communicate or respond to Plaintiff in a timely fashion;
 - b. Failing to inspect the damaged property in a timely fashion;
 - c. Failing to retain the services of an engineer and experts in a timely fashion;
 - d. Failing to provide engineer reports in a timely fashion;
 - e. Failing to consider all facts in support of coverage;
 - f. Failing to abide by the policy terms and cover all damages caused by the vandalism loss; and
 - g. Failing to issue a final decision on the claim until many months after the damage occurred.
- 42. Essex's actions, in failing to properly adjust Plaintiff's claim, is a breach of the implied covenant of good faith and fair dealing.
- 43. Essex knowingly breached the implied covenant of good faith and fair dealing in an attempt to deprive Plaintiff of their rights and reasonable expectations under the insurance contract.
- 44. As a result of Essex's breach of the implied covenant of good faith and fair dealing,
 Plaintiff has suffered and will continue to suffer damages.

WHEREFORE, Plaintiff, OSCAR CONSTRUCTION SERVICES, LLC demands judgment against ESSEX INSURANCE COMPANY on Count Two for:

(a) Compensatory damages;

MERLIN LAW GROUP, PA 125 Half Mile Road Sude 201, Red Bank New Jersey, 07701

- (b) Consequential damages;
- Pre-judgment interest and post-judgment interest; (c)
- Costs of suit; (d)
- (e) Attomeys' fees; and
- (f) For such other relief as the court may deem equitable and just.

CERTIFICATION PURSUANT TO R. 4:5-1

I hereby certify that the matter in controversy is not the subject of any other action pending in any Court, is not the subject of a pending arbitration proceeding, and is not the subject of any other contemplated action or arbitration proceeding.

JURY DEMAND

Plaintiff hereby demands trial by jury as to all issues in the above matter.

DESIGNATION OF TRIAL ATTORNEY

In accordance with R. 4:25-4, Robert T. Trautmann, Esq., is hereby designated as trial counsel for the Plaintiff in the above matter.

MERLIN LAW GROUP, P.A.

Date: November 27, 2017 By: /s/Charles R. Mathis IV

> Charles R. Mathis IV, Esq. NJ Bar I.D. No.: 060872013 Robert T. Trautmann, Esq. NJ Bar I.D. No.: 037562005 125 Half Mile Road, Suite 200 Red Bank, New Jersey 07701 732-704-4647

732-704-4651 (Fax)

cmathis@merlinlawgroup.com rtrautmann@merlinlawgroup.com

Attorneys for Plaintiff

MERLIN LAW GROUP, PA 125 Half Mile Road Sude 201, Red Bank New Jersey, 07701 www Merlinbwaroup.com

ESSEX COUNTY - CIVIL DIVISION SUPERIOR COURT OF NJ 465 MARTIN LUTHER KING JR BLVD NEWARK NJ 07102

TRACK ASSIGNMENT NOTICE

COURT TELEPHONE NO. (973) 776-9300 COURT HOURS 8:30 AM - 4:30 FM

DATE: NOVEMBER 27, 2017

RE: OSCAR CONSTRUCTION S ERVICES, VS ESSEX INSURANC

DOCKET: ESX L -008312 17

THE ABOVE CASE HAS BEEN ASSIGNED TO: TRACK 2.

DISCOVERY IS 300 DAYS AND RUNS FROM THE FIRST ANSWER OR 90 DAYS FROM SERVICE ON THE FIRST DEFENDANT, WHICHEVER COMES FIRST.

THE PRETRIAL JUDGE ASSIGNED IS: HON DENNIS F. CAREY

IF YOU HAVE ANY QUESTIONS, CONTACT TEAM 003 AT: (973) 776-9300.

IF YOU BELIEVE THAT THE TRACK IS INAPPROPRIATE YOU MUST FILE A CERTIFICATION OF GOOD CAUSE WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE FILING OF YOUR PLEADING.
PLAINTIFF MUST SERVE COPIES OF THIS FORM ON ALL OTHER PARTIES IN ACCORDANCE WITH R.4:5A-2.

ATTENTION:

ATT: CHARLES R. MATHIS
MERLIN LAW GROUP
777 S HARBOUR ISLAND BLVD
SUITE 950
TAMPA FL 33602

ECOURTS

Appendix XII-B1



ATTORNEY SIGNATURE:

CIVIL CASE INFORMATION STATEMENT (CIS)

Use for initial Law Division
Civil Part pleadings (not motions) under Rule 4:5-1
Pleading will be rejected for filing, under Rule 1:5-6(c),
if information above the black bar is not completed
or attorney's signature is not affixed

FOR USE BY CLERK'S OFFICE ONLY
PAYMENT TYPE: CK CG CA
CHG/CK NO.
AMOUNT:
OVERPAYMENT:
BATCH NUMBER:

1	or attorney	rs signature is	not affixed		DATERNOMBER.	
ATTORNEY / PRO SE NAME TELEPHO		ONE NUMBER	COUNT	Y OF VENUE		
Charles R. Mathis IV, Esq.		(732)7	04-4647	Essex		
FIRM NAME (if applicable) Merlin Law Group, P.A.				DOCKET	DOCKET NUMBER (when available)	
OFFICE ADDRESS 125 Half Mile Road, Suite 201				DOCUM Compl	ENT TYPE laint	
Red Bank, NJ 07701				JURY DE	MAND YES	□ No
NAME OF PARTY (e.g., John	Doe, Plaintiff)	CAPTION		<u> </u>		
OSCAR CONSTRUCTION SERVICES, LLC, Plaintiff(s)		OSCAR CONSTRUCTION SERVICES, LLC v. ESSEX INSURANCE COMPANY				
CASE TYPE NUMBER (See reverse side for listing)	HURRICANE SANDY RELATED?	IS THIS A PROFESSIONAL MALPRACTICE CASE? ☐ YES ■ NO				
599	☐ YES ■ NO	IF YOU HAVE CHECKED "YES," SEE N.J.S.A. 2A:53 A -27 AND APPLICABLE CASE LAW REGARDING YOUR OBLIGATION TO FILE AN AFFIDAVIT OF MERIT.				
RELATED CASES PENDING	?	IF YES, LIST DOCKET NUMBERS				
☐ YES	■ No					
DO YOU ANTICIPATE ADDING ANY PARTIES (arising out of same transaction or occurrence)?		NAME OF DEFENDANT'S PRIMARY INSURANCE COMPANY (if known)				
☐ YES	■ No					■ UNKNOWN
THE INFORMATION PROVIDED ON THIS FORM CANNOT BE INTRODUCED INTO EVIDENCE.						
CASE CHARACTERISTICS F	OR PURPOSES OF DET	ERMINING IF CASE I	S APPROPRIATE	FOR MEDIATIC	N	
DO PARTIES HAVE A CURRENT, PAST OR IF YES, IS THAT RELATIONSHIP: RECURRENT RELATIONSHIP?						
YES	□ No	☐ EMPLOYER/EMPLOY ☐ FAMILIAL	ree 🔲	FRIEND/NEIGHBO BUSINESS	OR OTHER (e	ixpia:n)
DOES THE STATUTE GOVERNING THIS CASE PROVIDE FOR PAYMENT OFFEES BY THE LOSING PARTY?						□ No
USE THIS SPACE TO ALERT THE COURT TO ANY SPECIAL CASE CHARACTERISTICS THAT MAY WARRANT INDIVIDUAL MANAGEMENT OR ACCELERATED DISPOSITION						
DO YOU OR YOUR CLIE	DO YOU OR YOUR CLIENT NEED ANY DISABILITY ACCOMMODATIONS? YES NO		IF YES, PLEASE IDENTIFY THE REQUESTED ACCOMMODATION			
WILL AN INTERPRETER ☐ YES	BE NEEDED? NO		IF YES, FOR WH	IAT LANGUAGE?		
I certify that confidential personal identifiers have been redacted from documents now submitted to the court, and will be redacted from all documents submitted in the future in accordance with Rule 1:38-7(b)						

Effective 06/05/2017, CN 10517 page 1 of 2



CIVIL CASE INFORMATION STATEMENT

(CIS)

	Use for initial pleadings (not motions) under Rule 4:5-1
SE TYPE	ES (Choose one and enter number of case type in appropriate space on the reverse side.)
151 175 302 399 502 505 506 510 511 512 801	NAME CHANGE FORFEITURE TENANCY REAL PROPERTY (other than Tenancy, Contract, Condemnation, Complex Commercial or Construction) BOOK ACCOUNT (debt collection matters only) OTHER INSURANCE CLAIM (including declaratory judgment actions) PIP COVERAGE UM or UIM CLAIM (coverage issues only) ACTION ON NEGOTIABLE INSTRUMENT LEMON LAW SUMMARY ACTION OPEN PUBLIC RECORDS ACT (summary action) OTHER (briefly describe nature of action)
305 509 599 603 603 605 610 621	II - 300 days' discovery CONSTRUCTION EMPLOYMENT (other than CEPA or LAD) CONTRACT/COMMERCIAL TRANSACTION N AUTO NEGLIGENCE - PERSONAL INJURY (non-verbal threshold) Y AUTO NEGLIGENCE - PERSONAL INJURY (verbal threshold) PERSONAL INJURY AUTO NEGLIGENCE - PROPERTY DAMAGE UM or UIM CLAIM (includes bodily injury) TORT - OTHER
005 301 602 604 606 607 608 609 616	III - 450 days' discovery CIVIL RIGHTS CONDEMNATION ASSAULT AND BATTERY MEDICAL MALPRACTICE PRODUCT LIABILITY PROFESSIONAL MALPRACTICE TOXIC TORT DEFAMATION WHISTLEBLOWER / CONSCIENTIOUS EMPLOYEE PROTECTION ACT (CEPA) CASES INVERSE CONDEMNATION LAW AGAINST DISCRIMINATION (LAD) CASES
156 303 508 513 514 620	IV - Active Case Management by Individual Judge i 450 days' discovery ENVIRONMENTAL/ENVIRONMENTAL COVERAGE LITIGATION MT. LAUREL COMPLEX COMMERCIAL COMPLEX CONSTRUCTION INSURANCE FRAUD FALSE CLAIMS ACT ACTIONS IN LIEU OF PREROGATIVE WRITS
271 274 281 282 285 286 287 289	ACCUTANE/ISOTRETINOIN ACCUTANE/ISOTRETINOIN RISPERDAL/SEROQUEL/ZYPREXA BRISTOL-MYERS SQUIBB ENVIRONMENTAL FOSAMAX STRYKER TRIDENT HIP IMPLANTS LEVAQUIN YAZIYASMIN/OCELLA REGLAN POMPTON LAKES ENVIRONMENTAL LITIGATION 292 PELVIC MESH/BARD DEPUY ASR HIP IMPLANT LITIGATION 293 ALLODERM REGENERATIVE TISSUE MATRIX STRYKER REJUVENATE/ABG II MODULAR HIP STEM COMPONENTS MIRENA CONTRACEPTIVE DEVICE OLMESARTAN MEDOXOMIL MEDICATIONS/BENICAR TALC-BASED BODY POWDERS ASBESTOS PROPECIA PELVIC MESH/GYNECARE 624 STRYKER LFIT CoCr V40 FEMORAL HEADS
in the s	eileve this case requires a track other than that provided above, please indicate the reason on Side 1, pace under "Case Characteristics.
PI	ease check off each applicable category 🏻 🔲 Putative Class Action 🔻 🗍 Title 59

Effective 06/05/2017, CN 10517 page 2 of 2